

OPINIONS

by a member of the scientific jury, for the academic position of "Associate Professor" according to announced competitions
 by the D. A. Tsenov Academy of Economics – Svishtov

CANDIDATES:

Alexandrina Borisova Alexandrova PhD

Taner Mustafov Ismailov PhD

Tanya Plamenova Todorova PhD

(candidates are listed in alphabetical order by name)

AUTHOR OF OPINIONS

Professor Sava Hristov Dimov PhD

CANDIDATE 1

Alexandrina Borisova Alexandrova PhD

The author of the scientific opinion evaluates each section from 4 to 14 with points in the range 0 - 10	0 - 10
Reference information	
1. Presentation of the candidate for participation in the competition	
Completed scientific specialty:	
"Finance, Money Circulation, Credit and Insurance (Finance)", D. A. Tsenov Academy of Economics – Svishtov.	
Department for which the competition is announced:	
"General Theory of Economics".	
2. Reason for writing an opinion	
Decision of the Faculty Council	
Protocol No. 11/11.06.2025 for the announced competition for the academic position of "Associate Professor", field of higher education 3. Social, economic and legal sciences, professional field 3.8. Economics, scientific specialty "Political Economy".	
Order of the Rector of the higher education institution	
Order No. 475, Svishtov, June 12, 2025, issued by Rector Associate Professor Marin Marinov PhD.	
Regulations for the implementation of the law on the development of the academic staff at the D. A. Tsenov Academy of Economics – Svishtov	
Article 5, paragraph 1 and Article 121, paragraphs 1 and 2 of the Rules of Procedure.	
3. Personal characteristics of the candidate	
Professional biography	
An applied European CV format, which shows that the candidate is: Honorary Assistant Professor at the Department of Finance and Credit, Assistant and Chief Assistant Professor at the Department of General Economic Theory, Expert (External Evaluator), Licensed English and Spanish Language Trainer. The candidate is actively involved in the implementation of European projects.	
Diploma for the educational and scientific degree "PhD Students"	
Diploma No. 2017015, issued on: April 6, 2017, signed by Associate Professor Ivan Marchevski PhD (Rector), Professor Yordan Vassilev PhD and Professor Rumana Lilova PhD. Defended dissertation on the topic "Optimization of the Tax System in the Republic of Bulgaria", 2017.	
Diploma for the scientific degree "Doctor of Science"	
has not been deposited.	
Diploma for the academic position of "Associate Professor"	
has not been deposited.	
Qualitative and quantitative assessment of deposited scientific publications	
4. Overall (quantitative and qualitative) assessment of teaching and learning work	
Developed and taught lecture courses: 22, plus 3 Personal finance, Financial analysis, European tax systems (Baltic International Academy – Latvia), "Communication and foreign language (foreign language of the profession – English)", Certification course "Spanish language A1 and B1.	10
Published university textbook: 4 co-authored; University teaching aids: 2 co-authored.	7
Evidence of activities: 20, according to the attached List.	10
Academic employment. Academic years: 2021/2022 = 374.75 hours; 2022/2023 = 660.78; 2023/2024 = 713.8; 2024/2025 = 450.92. Received excess norm: 29.43%.	10

5. General (quantitative and qualitative) assessment of scientific research and research activities	
Monograph for habilitation: Alexandrova, A. (2025) Financial Literacy in Bulgaria. Academic Publishing House "Tsenov", Reviewers: Prof. Penka Shishmanova PhD, Assoc. Prof. Marin Marinov PhD, ISBN 978-954-23-2551-2, 164.	10
Studies published in scientific journals, refereed and indexed in world-renowned databases: Scopus and WoS (3, co-authored, 10 authors).	10
Articles and reports published in scientific journals, refereed and indexed in world-renowned databases: Scopus - 5 co-authored (18 authors); Web of Science - 2 co-authored (7 authors).	10
Articles and reports published in non-refereed journals: 10 (9 co-authored, 1 independent); Reports - 18 (13 authored, 5 co-authored).	10
6. Актуалност и значимост	
Relevance of the researched issue.	10
Subject, object, goal and objectives of the researched problems.	10
Proven and defended research paradigms.	10
Limitations of the scientific research conducted.	9
7. Theoretical and methodological study of the problems	
Knowledge and understanding of basic facts and concepts.	9
Critical analysis of the main literary and normative sources.	7
Validity of the applied methods for collecting and processing information.	7
8. Empirical study of the problems	
The need to raise and resolve the issue of theory and practice.	10
Level and analysis of the results obtained.	10
Relevance of the data used.	10
Specificity and applicability of conclusions and recommendations.	10
9. Plagiarism and copying	
Use of the "copy & paste" practice - not found. Similarity Report - indicators KC1 and KC2 (StrikePlagiarism.com) has not been applied. Plagiarism Declaration is available.	10
Copying tests without using sources - not found.	10
Bibliographic citation style used.	10
10. Writing style and format	
Spelling and punctuation.	10
Scientific terminology.	10
Visualization of used data (Tables, charts and figures).	10
Complete design: exterior and interior.	10
11. Testing and proving hypotheses	
Testing working hypotheses.	7
Conclusions and recommendations.	8
12. Mathematical-statistical and probabilistic models used for forecasting and modeling	
Mathematical and statistical methods.	10
Probabilistic models.	8
Forecasting methods.	7
Data Analysis.	10
13. Guidelines for scientific contributions in monographic work	
First , a successful comparative analysis of the level of financial literacy in the European Union and Bulgaria has been conducted. Adequate, authorial conclusions have been drawn from it.	10
Second , the author's empirical study of the level of financial literacy of the adult population in the Republic of Bulgaria in 2024 was conducted. The author's results, forecasts and conclusions are indicated.	10
Third , the problem of youth financial literacy of basic competencies has been examined. A test assessment of its components has been made. The dependence has been confirmed that the "scissors" between financially literate and lagging countries in this regard is significantly opening up.	10
Fourth , the author is also interested in the results that the respondents registered regarding their financial behavior. They are based on a complex assessment obtained based on the number of positive answers. The author also emphasizes the government policy in the field of financial literacy. Recommendations are offered for its improvement.	10

14. Academic reputation – citations of the candidate in publications by other researchers			
A detailed list of citations of publications in which Alexandrina Alexandrova PhD has participated is attached, as follows: Scopus: 40 (Number of points per citation = 15); Web of Science: 33 (Number of points per citation = 15). Corresponding links to the citations are provided.			10
Google Scholar: 149, (Points per citation: 5).			10
Level of academic prominence: Impressively high.			10
15. Notable flaws and critical remarks			
In my opinion, no significant flaws or criticisms have been identified. Perhaps the candidate for associate professor, Alexandrina Alexandrova, should have considered writing her own textbook or teaching aid, or rejected the desire for collectivity in her scientific output. This affects the "academic reputation" (citation) indicator.			
In my opinion, there are too many lecture courses developed and taught (22). This affects the competence and adequacy of the author's assessments, analyses, and forecasts.			
AUTHOR'S ASSESSMENT OF THE OPINION:	6	Number of points	369

EVALUATION CRITERIA			Maximum points	390
Assessment thresholds (greater than:)	Scale	from-to (%)	Ratings	
331,5		85-100%	Very high (6)	
292,5		75-84%	High (5)	
253,5		65-74%	Good (4)	
195,0		50-64%	Medium (3)	
		<50%	Unsatisfactory (2)	

Recommendations and questions for the candidate

Recommendation 1. In my opinion, Alexandrina Borislavova Alexandrova PhD is a well-established and renowned lecturer in Bulgaria and abroad. In this context, I would recommend that the candidate for associate professor demonstrate more independence in her scientific research.

Recommendation 2. It is not necessary to explore so many aspects of scientific knowledge in economics. I am convinced that you can focus your professional interests on 5 or 6 interrelated scientific fields. This will make you appear more authoritative and serious among the scientific community.

CONCLUSION OF THE AUTHOR OF THE SCIENTIFIC OPINION:

According to the assessment scale (criteria) methodology I used, associate professor candidate Alexandrina Borisova Alexandrova PhD accumulated 369 points out of a maximum of 390, or 94.61%. With this high result, I sincerely wish her every success in her personal and academic life.

CANDIDATE 2

Taner Mustafaov Ismailov PhD

Reference information
1. Presentation of the candidate for participation in the competition
Completed scientific specialty:
"Economic and Financial Control", D. A. Tsenov Academy of Economics - Svishtov.
Department for which the competition is announced:
"General Theory of Economics".
2. Reason for writing an opinion
Decision of the Faculty Council
Protocol No. 11/11.06.2025 on the announced competition for the academic position of "associate professor", field of higher education 3. Social, economic and legal sciences, professional direction 3.8. Economics, scientific specialty "Political Economy".
Order of the Rector of the higher education institution
Order No. 475, Svishtov, June 12, 2025, issued by Rector Associate Professor Marin Marinov PhD.
Regulations for the implementation of the law on the development of academic staff at D. A. Tsenov Academy of Economics – Svishtov
Article 5, paragraph 1, and Article 121, paragraphs 1 and 2, of the Rules of Procedure.
3. Personal characteristics of the candidate
Professional biography

Applied European CV format, which shows that the candidate has: Publication reputation as follows Scopus Author ID: 57226594364 H-index - (4 publications); WOS Researcher ID: AIC-6073-2022 H-index 2; (8 publications); SciProfiles: 3268887; Google Scholar: H-index 5; He has been a lecturer (assistant), assistant doctor, and senior assistant doctor at the D. A. Tsenov Academy of Economics in Svishtov. Candidate Ismailov has high language skills in English, Turkish, and German. The candidate is actively involved in the implementation of European projects.	
Diploma for educational and scientific degree "PhD Students"	
Diploma No. 2015011, issued on March 25, 2015, signed by Professor Velichko Adamov PhD (Rector), Professor Rumyana Lilova Naydenova PhD, and Professor Lyuben Kirev PhD. Awarded an educational and scientific degree of "Doctor of Political Economy." Defended dissertation on "Income inequality in Bulgaria and opportunities for small business development," 2015.	
Diploma for the academic degree "Doctor of Science".	
has not been deposited.	
Diploma for the academic position of "Associate Professor".	
has not been deposited.	
Qualitative and quantitative assessment of deposited scientific publications	
4. Overall (quantitative and qualitative) assessment of teaching and learning activities	
Lecture courses taught: 31; lecture courses developed: 9.	10
Published university textbooks: 4 in total, co-authored - Macroeconomics, 2025; Economics (Microeconomics and Macroeconomics), 2024; Economic Theories, distance learning textbook, 2024; Tax Policy, 2021; Customs Duties and Customs Policy (selected lectures), 2021; and Microeconomics, 2024 (tests, exercises, discussion questions).	9
Research projects in which the candidate has participated since defending their doctoral thesis: 16 in total, related to artificial intelligence and sustainable development, the Danube and the Black Sea (project doctorates in the green and blue economy and Industry 5.0 management), Rights and values, fiscal discipline and increasing fiscal capacity, and others.	10
Academic employment. Academic years: 2020/2021 = 407.14 hours; 2021/2022 = 530.4; 2022/2023 = 469.8; 2023/2024 = 830.16; 2024/2025 = 679.12. Received excess: 21.52%.	10
5. General (quantitative and qualitative) assessment of scientific research and research activities	
Independent monographs for habilitation: Ismailov, T. (2023) Sustainable consumption of households in Bulgaria. Veliko Tarnovo, Publisher: ACCESS Press Publishing house, ISBN 978-619-92302-4-4, 148; Ismailov, T. (2023) Income Inequality in Bulgaria and Opportunities for Small Business Development. Veliko Tarnovo, Publisher: ACCESS Press Publishing house, ISBN 978-619-92302-5-1, 222; Published chapter from a collective monograph: Tokhtamysh, T, S. Hlibko, Y. Akhmedyarov & Ismailov, T. (2025) Eco-Friendly Dairy Products: International Context and Prospects. In book: Globalization, Global Security, and New International Realities for Modern Democracies. Published by IGI Global Scientific Publishing. ISBN: 9798337313573, 403-432.	10
Studies published in scientific journals, referenced and indexed in world-renowned databases: 2 in total, co-authored.	10
publications in Scopus, Author ID: 57226594364 H-index; 6 publications in WOS, Researcher ID: AIC-6073-2022 H-index 2, co-authored.	10
Articles and reports published in non-refereed journals: 12, solo and co-authored.	10
6. Relevance and significance	
Relevance of the researched issue.	10
Subject, object, purpose, and tasks of the problems studied.	10
Proven and defended scientific research paradigms.	10
Limitations of the scientific research conducted.	9
7. Theoretical and methodological study of the problems	
Knowledge and understanding of basic facts and concepts.	10
Critical analysis of the main literary and normative sources.	7
Validity of the applied methods for collecting and processing information.	7
8. Empirical research on the problems	
The need to raise and resolve the issue of theory and practice.	10
Level and analysis of the results obtained.	10
Relevance of the data used.	10
Specificity and applicability of conclusions and recommendations.	10
9. Plagiarism and copying	
Use of the "copy & paste" practice - not found. No similarity report has been submitted - indicators KC1 and KC2 (StrikePlagiarism.com). Only a declaration of plagiarism is available.	10
Copying tests without using sources - not observed.	10
Style used for bibliographic citation.	10
10. Writing style and format	
Spelling and punctuation.	10
Scientific terminology.	10
Visualization of used data (Tables, charts and figures).	10
Complete design: exterior and interior.	10

11. Testing and proving hypotheses			
Tested working hypotheses.			8
Conclusions and recommendations.			10
12. Mathematical-statistical and probabilistic models used for forecasting and modeling			
Mathematical and statistical methods.			10
Probabilistic models.			8
Forecasting methods.			7
Data Analysis.			9
13. Guidelines for scientific contributions in monographic works			
First, the theoretical foundations and practical approaches for implementing the concept of sustainable development are studied. Through analysis, the degree of applicability of sustainable consumption among Bulgarian households is established.			10
Second, the hypothesis of a complex nonlinear relationship between financial literacy and carbon footprint has been proven - at low levels of financial literacy, the carbon footprint tends to increase, while at high levels in developed countries it decreases.			10
Third, the dimensions of youth unemployment as a socio-economic problem in the European Union have been examined. It has been proven that the lack of opportunities to gain professional experience at a young age creates conditions for permanent exclusion from the labor market.			10
Fourth, a correlation analysis is applied to examine the relationship between the size of credit institutions and their financial condition and performance. The author demonstrates that all analyzed indicators show a strong or moderate relationship, with larger banking institutions demonstrating better results in terms of return on assets.			10
14. Academic reputation – citations of the candidate in publications by other researchers			
Citations or reviews in scientific publications indexed in world-renowned databases: 465 points. (69.4%), 31 in total; Citations in monographs and collective volumes with scientific review: 10 points (1.5%), 1 in total.			10
Citations or reviews in non-refereed journals with scientific review: 195 points (29.1%), 39 in total. Total: 670 points.			10
Level of academic renown: Impressively high.			10
15. Notable flaws and critical remarks			
Taner Mustafaov Ismailov PhD has found the right field for scientific growth. He has focused his scientific output on several interesting scientific areas. He possesses the necessary linguistic and professional knowledge, experience, and skills for scientific and teaching work. In this context, I have no comments regarding any significant weaknesses.			
AUTHOR'S ASSESSMENT OF THE OPINION			
6			
Number of points			374

EVALUATION CRITERIA		Maximum points	390
Boundary points for assessment	Range from-to (%)	Ratings	
331,5	85-100%	Very high (6)	
292,5	75-84%	High (5)	
253,5	65-74%	Good (4)	
195,0	50-64%	Medium (3)	
	<50 %	Unsatisfactory (2)	

Recommendations and questions for the candidate:

Recommendation 1. Candidate Taner Mustafaov Ismailov PhD is a well-established university lecturer. In this context, I would recommend that the candidate not venture into all areas of economic knowledge. It is impossible to be professionally competent in all of the "31 and others" lecture courses he has developed.

Recommendation 2. Since you have prepared two separate monographs for the competition, you need to publish an author's textbook on Micro- and Macroeconomics.

CONCLUSION OF THE AUTHOR OF THE SCIENTIFIC OPINION: According to the assessment scale (criteria) methodology I used, associate professor candidate Taner Mustafaov Ismailov PhD scored 374 points out of a maximum of 390, or 95.88%. With this highest result in the competition, I sincerely wish him complete personal and scientific success.

CANDIDATE 3

Tanya Plamenova Todorova PhD

Reference information
1. Presentation of the candidate for participation in the competition
Completed scientific specialty:
"Accounting and Control" and "International Economic Relations", D. A. Tsenov Academy of Economics - Svishtov.

Department for which the competition is being announced:	
"General Theory of Economics".	
2. Reason for writing an opinion	
Faculty Council Decision	
Protocol No. 11/11.06.2025 on the announced competition for the academic position of "associate professor", field of higher education 3. Social, economic and legal sciences, professional direction 3.8. Economics, scientific specialty "Political Economy".	
Order of the Rector of the higher education institution	
Order No. 475, Svishtov, June 12, 2025, issued by Rector Associate Professor Marin Marinov PhD.	
Regulations for the implementation of the law on the development of academic staff at D. A. Tsenov Academy of Economics	
Article 5, paragraph 1, and Article 121, paragraphs 1 and 2, of the Rules of Procedure.	
3. Personal characteristics of the candidate	
Professional biography	
A European format CV "Europass" has been submitted, which shows that the candidate is: assistant (2006-2009), senior assistant professor (since 2012) at the Department of General Economic Theory, D.A. Tsenov Academy of Economics - Svishtov, and Associate Professor at the Department of Finance at the Higher School of Agribusiness and Regional Development - Plovdiv. He has language skills (understanding, speaking) in English - level C2, and in German (understanding, speaking, writing) - level B1.	
Diploma for educational and scientific degree "PhD Students"	
Diploma No. 2012040, issued on: October 22, 2012, signed by Professor Velichko Adamov PhD (Rector), Associate Professor Romyana Lilova PhD, and Professor Snezhana Naydenova PhD. Defended dissertation on the topic "Efficiency of Public Expenditure in the Bulgarian Economy (Macroeconomic Aspects)", 2012.	
Diploma for the scientific degree "Doctor of Science"	
not deposited.	
Diploma for the academic position of "Associate Professor"	
Number/date of appointment act: R-AC-34 / 28.09.2016	
Qualitative and quantitative assessment of deposited scientific publications	
4. Overall (quantitative and qualitative) assessment of teaching and learning work	
Developed and taught lecture courses: Bachelor's degree 4 courses: Microeconomics (jointly with Professor Penka Shishmanova PhD), Applied Economics, Comparative Economic Systems, Methodology of Economic Research (independently); Master's degree - World Economy (independently).	10
Published university textbooks: co-authored "Economics (Microeconomics and Macroeconomics)", 2024; "World Economy", 2023; "Microeconomics", 2021; "Macroeconomics", 2021; "Economic Theories", 2021. Independently "Microeconomics", 2019, 142; "Macroeconomics", 2018, 156; "Stock Exchanges and Stock Exchange Operations", 2018, 152; "Economic Theories (A Brief History of Economic Thought)", 2015, 124.	10
Evidence of activities: 16, related to: published textbooks 4; teaching aids 3; scientific research activities 9.	10
Academic employment. Academic years: 2020/2021 = 517.36 hours; 2021/2022 = 338.5; 2022/2023 = 508.05; 2023/2024 = 523.75; 2024/2025 = 574.25. Received excess: 14.52%	10
5. General (quantitative and qualitative) assessment of scientific research and research activities	
Monograph for habilitation: The submitted for participation in the current competition (SG issue 32/15. 04. 2025) "Todorova, T. (2016) Public revenues and economic growth. Publishing house "Macros" - Plovdiv, ISBN: 978-954-561-414-9, 176" participates in the competition for associate professor at the University of Agricultural Research and Development - Plovdiv (SG issue 33/26. 04. 2016).	5
Studies published in scientific journals, referenced and indexed in world-renowned databases: Scopus and Web of Science (WOS). (not deposited).	0
Articles and reports published in scientific journals, refereed and indexed in world-renowned databases: Scopus, Web of Science (WOS) (2 co-authored, as follows: 6.1. six authors; 6.2. three authors).	9
Articles and reports published in non-refereed journals: 22 (21 independent, 1 co-authored; Studies published in non-refereed publications: 4 (1 independent, 3 co-authored).	10
6. Relevance and significance	
Relevance of the researched issues.	10
Subject, object, goal and objectives of the researched problems.	10
Proven and defended scientific research paradigms.	10
Limitations of the scientific research conducted.	9
7. Theoretical and methodological study of the problems	
Knowledge and understanding of basic facts and concepts.	10
Critical analysis of the main literary and normative sources.	8
Validity of the applied methods for collecting and processing information.	9
8. Empirical study of the problems	
The need to pose and solve the problem for theory and practice.	10
Level and analysis of the results obtained.	10

Relevance of the data used.	10
Specificity and applicability of conclusions and recommendations.	10
9. Plagiarism and copying	
Use of the "copy & paste" practice - not found. No similarity report has been submitted - indicators KC1 and KC2 (StrikePlagiarism.com). Only the author's Declaration of Plagiarism is available.	10
Copying tests without using sources - not observed.	10
Style used for bibliographic citation.	9
10. Writing style and format	
Spelling and punctuation.	10
Scientific terminology.	10
Visualization of data used (tables, charts, and figures).	9
Complete design of publications: external and internal.	10
11. Testing and proving hypotheses	
Tested working hypotheses.	8
Conclusions and recommendations.	10
12. Mathematical-statistical and probabilistic models used for forecasting and modeling	
Mathematical and statistical methods.	10
Probabilistic models.	8
Forecasting methods.	8
Data Analysis.	10
13. Guidelines for major scientific contributions	
First , there is an empirical study of the dynamics of public revenues in Bulgaria and the countries that joined the European Union in 2004 and 2007. A comparative empirical analysis of the structure of tax revenues has been carried out, defining arguments for reducing their relative share in Gross domestic product.	10
Second , using econometric analysis, the author has assessed the impact of the budget balance on economic growth. The results are the product of a single-factor linear regression model.	10
Third , through adequate econometric analysis, a relationship between economic growth and public spending has been proven. In this context, the inverse relationship between direct and indirect tax revenues in the budget and their impact on the cyclical growth of the economy has also been examined.	10
Fourth , the main trends in the development of public spending (2000-2010) are outlined. The possibilities for reducing their relative share in the Gross Domestic Product are defined. The author proposes their functional and economic restructuring from unproductive to productive economic activities and from current and transfer to investment spending.	10
14. Academic reputation – citations of the candidate in publications by other researchers	
A detailed list of citations of publications in which Associate Professor Tanya Todorova PhD has participated is attached, as follows: in scientific publications referenced and indexed in world-renowned databases: 28, total points received 420; in monographs and collective volumes, with scientific review 18, points 180.	10
In non-refereed journals, with scientific review 3, points 10.	10
Level of academic prominence: Impressively high.	10
15. Notable flaws and critical remarks	
In my opinion, no significant flaws or criticisms have been identified. Perhaps, the candidate Associate Professor Tanya Todorova PhD should have thought about a new independent monograph, and not relied on the one from 2016. The statistical databases used cover the period 2000-2010.	
In my view, the thesis draws on and further develops ideas from publications submitted in a competition for the award of a doctoral degree. It may be necessary to revise the concept of a balanced budget deficit and its impact on economic growth.	
AUTHOR'S ASSESSMENT OF THE OPINION	6
Number of points	362

EVALUATION CRITERIA		Maximum points	390
Boundary points for assessment	Range from-to (%)	Ratings	
331,5	85-100%	Very high (6)	
292,5	75-84%	High (5)	
253,5	65-74%	Good (4)	
195,0	50-64%	Medium (3)	
	<50 %	Unsatisfactory (2)	

Recommendations and questions for the candidate

Recommendation 1. In my opinion, Associate Professor Tanya Plamenova Todorova PhD is a well-established and renowned lecturer in Bulgaria and abroad. In this context, I would recommend that the candidate for associate professor demonstrate more independence in scientific research, especially in publications referenced and indexed in world-renowned scientific information databases.

CONCLUSION OF THE AUTHOR OF THE SCIENTIFIC OPINION: According to the assessment scale (criteria) methodology I used, the candidate, Associate Professor Tanya Plamenova Todorova PhD, accumulated 362 points out of a maximum of 390, or 92.82%. With this high result, I sincerely wish her every success in her personal and professional life.

FINAL RANKING OF THE CANDIDATES

Ranking	Candidate	Points	Percentage
1	Taner Mustafov Ismailov PhD	374	95,90%
2	Alexandrina Borislavova Alexandrova PhD	369	94,62%
3	Tanya Plamenova Todorova PhD	362	92,82%

Date: July 30, 2025

Signature: prof. Sava Dimov PhD